

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### I. INTRODUCTION

|                                                                        |    |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 1. THE THEOLOGICAL QUESTION AND APPROACH .....                         | 9  |
| The problem.....                                                       | 9  |
| General aim of this study.....                                         | 13 |
| Method .....                                                           | 16 |
| A modern philosophical dimension .....                                 | 22 |
| Note on “ <i>modus significandi</i> ” .....                            | 25 |
| 2. THE FIRST OECUMENICAL COUNCIL.....                                  | 27 |
| 3. THE CAPPADOCIANS.....                                               | 31 |
| Basil the Great, Gregory of Nazianzus and Gregory of Nyssa.....        | 31 |
| Initial conceptual clarifications.....                                 | 32 |
| The concept of “nature” .....                                          | 32 |
| The term “hypostasis”: nascent vocabulary problems .....               | 35 |
| The term πρόσωπον.....                                                 | 37 |
| General philosophical perspective.....                                 | 38 |
| Integration of these concepts in the writings of Basil the Great       |    |
| ~ Gregory of Nyssa .....                                               | 39 |
| Gregory of Nazianzus.....                                              | 46 |
| Gregory of Nyssa.....                                                  | 47 |
| Conclusion .....                                                       | 49 |
| A word about individuality and the “problem of individuation” .....    | 51 |
| 4. SECOND OECUMENICAL COUNCIL.....                                     | 57 |
| 5. NESTORIUS AND CYRIL OF ALEXANDRIA.....                              | 61 |
| Nestorius and Nestorianism.....                                        | 61 |
| Correspondence between the philosophy of Nestorius and the             |    |
| Cappadocians .....                                                     | 62 |
| Πρόσωπον and ὑπόστασις .....                                           | 65 |
| Consequences for Nestorius’ interpretation of the unity in Christ..... | 67 |
| Cyril of Alexandria .....                                              | 70 |
| Axis placed in relief by Cyril.....                                    | 71 |
| Conclusion .....                                                       | 77 |
| 6. THE THIRD AND FOURTH OECUMENICAL COUNCILS.....                      | 81 |

|                                                                                      |     |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 7. THE TERM "PERSONA" – PREAMBLE TO THE LATIN ELABORATION.....                       | 93  |
| Its etymology.....                                                                   | 93  |
| Assumption of the term " <i>persona</i> " in Trinitarian theology: Tertullian.....   | 93  |
| 8. BOETHIUS AND A METAPHYSICS OF NORMATIVE VALUE.....                                | 97  |
| Boethius.....                                                                        | 97  |
| A definition of "nature".....                                                        | 100 |
| Defining "person".....                                                               | 105 |
| A question of language.....                                                          | 109 |
| Subsistence and its relation to substance.....                                       | 110 |
| Ontological principles behind " <i>subsistentia</i> " and " <i>substantia</i> "..... | 115 |
| Brief comparison with the "classical" notion of subsistence.....                     | 117 |
| <i>Subsistentia est id quod est; subsistentia est "esse"</i> .....                   | 119 |
| Specific aspects of <i>substantia</i> and <i>subsistentia</i> .....                  | 121 |
| Relative architecture of the ontological notions.....                                | 127 |
| Some observations.....                                                               | 130 |
| A possible divisive Christological argument.....                                     | 132 |
| Objection and alternatives to the argument.....                                      | 133 |
| Conclusion.....                                                                      | 134 |
| 9. THE FIFTH, SIXTH AND EIGHTH OECUMENICAL COUNCILS.....                             | 137 |
| 10. GILBERT OF POITIERS AND RICHARD OF SAINT-VICTOR.....                             | 149 |
| Gilbert of Poitiers.....                                                             | 150 |
| The general distinction.....                                                         | 152 |
| Important questions raised by this distinction.....                                  | 154 |
| Application of the distinction to God.....                                           | 154 |
| The same distinction between the divine persons and their properties.....            | 156 |
| Conclusion.....                                                                      | 158 |
| Richard of St. Victor.....                                                           | 160 |
| An attempt to situate personhood beyond the category of substance.....               | 161 |
| A distinction of common and incommunicable existence.....                            | 165 |
| Types of incommunicability.....                                                      | 166 |
| Corollary for the definition of person.....                                          | 167 |
| How persons can be distinguished without entailing a distinction<br>of nature.....   | 168 |
| Definition of the person as an incommunicable existence.....                         | 171 |
| Terminological substitutions or different conceptual content?.....                   | 172 |
| Conclusion.....                                                                      | 175 |

|                                                         |     |
|---------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 11. SAINT ALBERT AND THE UNCOVERING OF PERSONALITY..... | 177 |
| Albert the Great.....                                   | 177 |
| Presentation.....                                       | 177 |
| The texts.....                                          | 179 |
| Sources.....                                            | 181 |
| Principal studies.....                                  | 183 |
| The scope of our work.....                              | 185 |

## II. THE NOTION OF PERSONALITY IN SAINT ALBERT THE GREAT

|                                                                                         |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 1. ONTOLOGICAL DIVISIONS AND SIGNIFICATION OF TERMS .....                               | 189 |
| Introduction .....                                                                      | 189 |
| First division of <i>ens</i> .....                                                      | 189 |
| A closer examination of substance.....                                                  | 196 |
| Οὐσία and ὑπόστασις as “substance” in different ways.....                               | 203 |
| On distinction according to mode of signification.....                                  | 207 |
| Ways of signifying the divine nature.....                                               | 210 |
| Hypostasis.....                                                                         | 218 |
| Possible objections.....                                                                | 223 |
| Back to defining hypostasis.....                                                        | 225 |
| The “standing under” proper to primary and secondary substance .....                    | 230 |
| The natural referent of “hypostasis”, its direct and indirect <i>significatum</i> ..... | 231 |
| The precise denotation of “hypostasis”, its distinctive mode of signification .....     | 233 |
| Logical priorities .....                                                                | 237 |
| Acts of the supposit.....                                                               | 238 |
| “Person” .....                                                                          | 240 |
| Universal chart.....                                                                    | 248 |
| Application of these distinctions in speaking about the Trinity.....                    | 248 |
| On the name “ <i>Deus</i> ” .....                                                       | 253 |
| On the name “Trinity” .....                                                             | 256 |
| A certain relativity of the terms “hypostasis” and “person” .....                       | 259 |
| The personal name.....                                                                  | 260 |
| A Christological issue.....                                                             | 264 |
| Conclusion .....                                                                        | 265 |
| 2. TOWARD DEFINING PERSON.....                                                          | 269 |
| Introduction .....                                                                      | 269 |
| Preliminary remark on the personal principle: a tentative hypothesis.....               | 269 |
| Four rudimentary senses of personhood .....                                             | 274 |
| Three basic elements in personhood – a working definition.....                          | 276 |

|                                                                                                                               |     |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| Person signifies substance plus something more .....                                                                          | 282 |
| On the substance which person signifies .....                                                                                 | 286 |
| Personal number indifferent to number in substance .....                                                                      | 289 |
| Person distinguished from nature or essence .....                                                                             | 290 |
| The distinguishing principle .....                                                                                            | 295 |
| The predicaments of "who", "how" and "what" .....                                                                             | 297 |
| Realizing personality in different kinds of persons .....                                                                     | 299 |
| Different kinds of modes of distinction .....                                                                                 | 299 |
| Distinction, but not diversity in the Trinity .....                                                                           | 304 |
| The bottom line for personality .....                                                                                         | 305 |
| <i>Discretio personalis in angelis et considerationes super individuationem</i> .....                                         | 306 |
| Conclusion .....                                                                                                              | 312 |
| <br>3. SHARING IN THE COMMON NOTION OF PERSON .....                                                                           | 315 |
| Relevance of the problem .....                                                                                                | 315 |
| How "person" is predicated .....                                                                                              | 315 |
| Community of proportion .....                                                                                                 | 320 |
| Conclusion .....                                                                                                              | 334 |
| <br>4. DEFINITIONS OF PERSON .....                                                                                            | 337 |
| Introduction .....                                                                                                            | 337 |
| Treatise in the <i>Sentences</i> : exposition and confirmation of Boethius .....                                              | 337 |
| A fourfold historical patrimony .....                                                                                         | 337 |
| Analogicity of the name .....                                                                                                 | 338 |
| Right interpretation of Boethius .....                                                                                        | 340 |
| Boethius' definition and the principal constituent of personality .....                                                       | 341 |
| The incommunicability imported by "individual" .....                                                                          | 347 |
| Contiguity with the other definitions .....                                                                                   | 349 |
| Treatise in the <i>Summa theologica</i> : valuation of Richard of Saint-Victor .....                                          | 350 |
| Reiteration of the several historically important definitions .....                                                           | 350 |
| Contentual equivalence between Boethius and Richard .....                                                                     | 351 |
| The first Victorine definition .....                                                                                          | 355 |
| The second Victorine definition .....                                                                                         | 360 |
| The definition of Master Lombard and the notion of dignity .....                                                              | 362 |
| Considerations on the separated soul and the humanity of Christ; the<br>criterion of the <i>omnino incommunicabilis</i> ..... | 365 |
| Communicability and incommunicability between the human nature<br>and the Word .....                                          | 367 |
| Three properties pertaining to distinction ascribed to personhood .....                                                       | 370 |
| The terms "singular", "individual" and "particular" in God .....                                                              | 373 |
| Conclusion .....                                                                                                              | 375 |

|                                                                                       |     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 5. MULTIPLYING INDIVIDUALS AND THE ROLE OF RELATION                                   |     |
| IN THE TRINITY.....                                                                   | 381 |
| Pinning down the distinguishing element.....                                          | 381 |
| Natural diversity and individuation, its exclusion in the Trinity.....                | 383 |
| Relation as unique source of multiplicity in the Trinity.....                         | 386 |
| Distinction through relation nevertheless requires a substantial                      |     |
| element.....                                                                          | 392 |
| Personal being.....                                                                   | 393 |
| Relation not only distinguishes, but constitutes the persons.....                     | 396 |
| Conclusion .....                                                                      | 397 |
| 6. NUMBER IN THE TRINITY AND IN MEN .....                                             | 399 |
| Number in the Trinity is <i>secundum quid</i> .....                                   | 399 |
| The nature of the distinctive principle determines the quality of                     |     |
| number.....                                                                           | 403 |
| The notion of " <i>terminus</i> ".....                                                | 404 |
| The reality of the relations (true number even if <i>quidam</i> ).....                | 408 |
| Essential oneness and personal number do not conflict.....                            | 410 |
| An <u>existential</u> distinction of several " <i>qui sunt</i> ".....                 | 412 |
| How the persons are three "things".....                                               | 415 |
| Substantial foundation for personal numerical unity.....                              | 417 |
| Notional act as the reason for numerical distinction.....                             | 422 |
| Order of nature in the Trinity.....                                                   | 423 |
| Conclusion .....                                                                      | 428 |
| 7. PROPRIETAS.....                                                                    | 433 |
| Persons differ only through their <i>proprietas</i> – a summary.....                  | 433 |
| Difference between hypostasis and <i>proprietas</i> .....                             | 434 |
| <i>Proprietas</i> as constitutive of all persons.....                                 | 436 |
| Modes of predication.....                                                             | 437 |
| Distinction between <i>proprietas</i> and distinction between the persons.....        | 440 |
| <i>Proprietas</i> and person, person and essence, essence and <i>proprietas</i> ..... | 442 |
| <i>Proprietas</i> and person.....                                                     | 442 |
| Person and essence.....                                                               | 446 |
| Essence and <i>proprietas</i> .....                                                   | 447 |
| Kinds of <i>proprietas</i> .....                                                      | 448 |
| <i>Proprietas personalis</i> and <i>proprietas personae</i> .....                     | 450 |
| The particular <i>proprietas</i> of the Trinity.....                                  | 453 |
| Determinate and indeterminate signification.....                                      | 453 |
| The personal property in men.....                                                     | 455 |
| Essentially constitutive of the person .....                                          | 455 |
| Comparative examination of "differences" for person.....                              | 457 |

|                                                                      |     |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| The appropriating <i>proprietas</i> and the appropriated thing ..... | 461 |
| Conclusion .....                                                     | 464 |

### III. SYNTHESIS AND OVERVIEW

|                                                          |     |
|----------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 1. OVERALL HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE.....                   | 471 |
| Cappadocian theology of the person .....                 | 471 |
| Cyrillian intuition.....                                 | 472 |
| Boethius and the “classical” definition of person .....  | 473 |
| Richard of Saint-Victor.....                             | 474 |
| Through the thirteenth century and Albert the Great..... | 475 |
| Thomas Aquinas and beyond .....                          | 476 |
| The Scotistic theory of personality.....                 | 482 |
| The theory of Capreolus.....                             | 485 |
| Cajetan and subsistence as substantial mode.....         | 487 |
| The system of Suárez.....                                | 492 |
| Modern reflections .....                                 | 499 |
| The relative conceptualization of J. Galot .....         | 502 |
| 2. FINAL CONCLUSION .....                                | 519 |
| Encapsulated results and value of this study.....        | 519 |
| Closing remarks.....                                     | 527 |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY .....                                       | 531 |
| INDEX OF NAMES .....                                     | 557 |
| ABBREVIATIONS.....                                       | 563 |